

# Submission to the Seanad Public Consultation Committee on Children's Mental Health in Ireland

May 2017



The Children's Rights Alliance unites over 100 members working together to make Ireland one of the best places in the world to be a child. We change the lives of all children in Ireland by making sure that their rights are respected and protected in our laws, policies and services.

22q11 Ag Eisteacht

Alcohol Action Ireland

Alliance Against Cutbacks in Education Amnesty International Ireland

**ASH Ireland** 

Assoc. for Criminal Justice Research and Development (ACJRD)

Association of Secondary Teachers Ireland (ASTI)

ATD Fourth World - Ireland Ltd

Atheist Ireland Autism Network Ireland

Barnardos

Barretstown Camp

Bedford Row Family Project
BeLong To Youth Services
Care Leavers' Network
Catholic Guides of Ireland
Child Care Law Reporting Project
Childhood Development Initiative

Children in Hospital Ireland COPE Galway Cork Life Centre Crosscare Cybersafe

Dental Health Foundation of Ireland

Department of Occupational Science and Occupational Therapy, UCC

Disability Federation of Ireland Down Syndrome Ireland Dublin Rape Crisis Centre Dun Laoghaire Refugee Project Early Childhood Ireland

Educate Together EPIC EQUATE Extern Ireland Focus Ireland Foróige

Future Voices Ireland Gaelscoileanna Teo

GLEN- the LGBTI equality network Immigrant Council of Ireland

Inclusion Ireland

Independent Hospitals Association of Ireland Institute of Community Health Nursing Institute of Guidance Counsellors Irish Association for Infant Mental Health Irish Association of Social Workers Irish Centre for Human Rights, NUI Galway Irish Congress of Trade Unions (ICTU)

Irish Council for Civil Liberties (ICCL)
Irish Foster Care Association

Irish Girl Guides Irish Heart Foundation

Irish National Teachers Organisation (INTO)

Irish Penal Reform Trust

**Children's Rights Alliance** 7 Red Cow Lane, Smithfield, Dublin 7, Ireland

Ph: +353 1 662 9400

Email: info@childrensrights.ie www.childrensrights.ie

Irish Primary Principals Network

Irish Refugee Council

Irish Second Level Students' Union (ISSU)

Irish Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children

Irish Traveller Movement Irish Youth Foundation (IYF) Jack & Jill Children's Foundation Jesuit Centre for Faith and Justice

Jigsaw

Kids' Own Publishing Partnership

Law Centre for Children and Young People

Lifestart National Office Mental Health Reform Migrant Rights Centre Ireland

Mounttown Neighbourhood Youth and Family Project

MyMind

National Childhood Network

National Organisation for the Treatment of Abusers (NOTA)

National Parents Council Post Primary National Parents Council Primary National Youth Council of Ireland

One Family
One in Four
Parentstop
Pavee Point

Peter McVerry Trust

Rape Crisis Network Ireland (RCNI)

Realt Beag

SAFE Ireland Saoirse Housing Association

SAOL Beag Children's Centre

Scouting Ireland

School of Education UCD Sexual Violence Centre Cork Simon Communities of Ireland

Social Care Ireland

Society of St. Vincent de Paul Sonas Domestic Violence Charity Special Needs Parents Association

SpunOut.ie

St. Nicholas Montessori College

St. Nicholas Montessori Teachers' Association

St. Patrick's Mental Health Services Step by Step Child & Family Project Suas Educational Development Teachers' Union of Ireland Terenure Rugby Football Club The Ark, A Cultural Centre for Children

The Prevention and Early Intervention Network

The UNESCO Child and Family Research Centre, NUI Galway

Traveller Visibility Group Ltd

Treoir UNICEF Ireland voungballymun

Youth Advocate Programme Ireland (YAP)

Youth Work Ireland

## 1. Introduction

The Children's Rights Alliance welcomes the opportunity to make a submission to the Seanad Public Consultation Committee on Children's Mental Health in Ireland.

The Children's Rights Alliance unites over 100 members working together to make Ireland one of the best places in the world to be a child. We change the lives of all children in Ireland by making sure that their rights are respected and protected in our laws, policies and services.

The Children's Rights Alliance is deeply concerned about the provision of mental health services to children and young people in Ireland. Recent studies suggest that young people in Ireland may have a higher rate of mental health issues than similarly aged young people in other countries. This has not resulted in a correlated level of service provision.

All children have a right to the enjoyment of the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health under Article 24 of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child. The UN Committee on the Rights of the Child has emphasised the serious nature of mental health problems for children and the need to tackle 'behavioural and social issues that undermine children's mental health, psychosocial wellbeing and emotional development'.<sup>3</sup>

The Children's Rights Alliance welcomes the introduction of the Mental Health (Amendment) Bill 2016 which proposes, if passed into law, to introduce a prohibition on the admission of children to adult psychiatric units. However, as recognised by the Seanad Committee, there is a need to not only prevent the admission of children into adult in-patient units but to also address the underlying issues in the Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services which result in these admissions taking place.

The Children's Rights Alliance recognises the important work of the Youth Mental Health Taskforce focusing on reducing stigma and providing greater information on services and community interventions. However, the Alliance notes that the scope of the Taskforce is limited as its Terms of Reference do not address pressing issues including the lack of primary care psychology services, inadequately funded CAMHS services as well as the availability of age-appropriate in-patient mental health services for young people<sup>4</sup> as outlined in this submission.

This submission highlights some of barriers to children accessing mental healthcare in Ireland and makes recommendations for the improvement of services for children and young people.

<sup>1</sup> Mary Cannon and others, The Mental Health of Young People in Ireland: A report of the Psychiatric Epideology Research across the Lifespan (PERL) Group (RCSI 2013) 7.

<sup>2</sup> Health Service Executive, Fifth Annual Child & Adolescent Mental Health Service Report 2012 – 2013 (HSE2014).

<sup>3</sup> UNCRC 'General Comment No. 15 on the Right of the Child to the Enjoyment of the Highest Attainable Standard of Health (Art 24)' (2013) UN Doc CRC/C/GC/15 para 38.

<sup>4</sup> Department of Health, 'Terms of Reference for the National Taskforce on Youth Mental Health' <a href="http://health.gov.ie/national-taskforce-on-youth-mental-health/terms-of-reference/">http://health.gov.ie/national-taskforce-on-youth-mental-health/terms-of-reference/</a> accessed 4 May 2017.

Children's Rights Alliance (2017) Submission to the Seanad Public Consultation Committee on Children's Mental Health in Ireland

# 2. Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services (CAMHS)

### **Waiting Lists for CAMHS**

The Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services (CAMHS) are underdeveloped and demand for CAMHS services continues to exceed availability. In December 2016, there were 2,419 children waiting for a first appointment with Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services. Of these 1,252 children were waiting for longer than three months and 210 were waiting over one year. In 2016, there was a 19.7 per cent increase in the number of children waiting more than a year for an appointment due to the lack of available primary care based psychological supports and recruitment difficulties in appointing clinical staff.

In 2016, the Committee on the Rights of the Child expressed its concern about children and young people's access to mental health treatment in Ireland and the long waiting list for mental health support and recommended the State take action to 'improve capacity and quality of mental health services'.<sup>8</sup>

There are significant staff shortages within CAMHS. Of the recommended 127 specialist teams needed for CAMHS to operate effectively, only 67 CAMHS teams are currently in operation, not all of which are operating at full capacity. There are geographic variances in service provision around the country, for example there are no services for 17 year olds in North Tipperary as the HSE has been unable to fill a clinician post. 11

There are challenges with the recruitment and retention of CAMHS staff,<sup>12</sup> including staff mobility between regions<sup>13</sup> and challenging work environment.<sup>14</sup> Achieving the full staff complement of CAMHS teams is vital to ensure children and young people are not put at risk waiting too long for vital supports. Reducing waiting lists for children and young people seeking to access mental health requires ongoing investment in the development of Child and Adolescent Community Mental Health teams.

It is clear that the lack of coordinated services is also impacting on service demand as in the case of one CAMHS service which has 'identified that the majority of their cases require Primary Care Service such as Psychology and Occupational Therapy'. There is an urgent need to develop and build the capacity of the primary care sector to respond to the needs of children with mental health difficulties. Health Organisation has acknowledged that integrating mental health services into primary care structures is 'the most viable way of closing the treatment gap and ensuring that people get the mental health care they need'. 17

### Recommendations

5 Health Service Executive, *Performance Report October – December 2016* (HSE 2016) 57.

<sup>6</sup> ibid

<sup>7</sup> The increases are mainly restricted to a small number of Community Healthcare Organisations. Communication received by the Children's Rights Alliance from the Health Service Executive, 24 January 2017.

<sup>8</sup> UNCRC, 'Concluding Observations: Ireland' (20016) UN Doc CRC/C/IRL/CO/3-4, para 53 (b).

<sup>9</sup> Department of Health, A Vision for Change, (2006 Stationery Office) (revised as per Census 2011). Health Service Executive, Fourth Annual Child and Adolescent Mental Health Service Report 2011–2012, (HSE 2012) 9.

<sup>10</sup> Minister of State for Mental Health and Older People, Helen McEntee TD, Dail Debates, Topical Issue Debate, Mental Health Services Tuesday 7 March 2017.

<sup>11</sup> ibid

<sup>12</sup> Health Service Executive, September Performance Report (Health Service Executive 2015) 10.

<sup>13</sup> Minister of State for Disability, Equality, Mental Health and Older People, Kathleen Lynch TD, Seanad Debates, Mental Health Services: Statements, 29 April 2015.

<sup>14</sup> ibid

<sup>15</sup> Health Service, Performance Report March/April 2016 (2016 HSE) 55.

<sup>16</sup> Children's Mental Health Commission, Meeting the Mental Health Support Needs of Children and Adolescents: A Children's Mental Health Coalition View (2015 CMHC) 15.

World Health Organisation, Integrating mental health into Primary Care: A Global Perspective (2008 WHO) 1.

<sup>4</sup> Children's Rights Alliance (2017) Submission to the Seanad Public Consultation Committee on Children's Mental Health in Ireland

- Primary care psychology services for children and young people should be introduced as a matter of priority.
- Adequate funding should be provided for ongoing development of Child and Adolescent Community Mental Health teams.

### **Children in Adult Units**

The UN Committee on the Rights of the Child states that, where placement in a psychiatric unit is necessary, adolescents should be separated from adults, where appropriate and emphasises that any decision on their care should be made in accordance with their best interests. <sup>18</sup> In 2016, the Committee on the Rights of the Child expressed concern at the ongoing practice of admitting children and young people to adult wards in Ireland due to a lack of suitable facilities. <sup>19</sup> In particular they highlighted inadequate access to age-appropriate mental health units and recommended the state take action to address the issue by 'improving the capacity and quality of its mental health-care services for in-patient treatment...'. <sup>20</sup>

The Mental Health Act 2001 is the primary legislation governing children with mental health problems and their access to mental health services. Even though the 2001 Act was only brought into effect in 2006, it is outdated and is not in line with Ireland's international human rights obligations, particularly as these relate to children. <sup>21</sup> The provisions of the 2001 Act relating to children and young people are spread throughout the Act so the extent to which provisions apply to children is unclear. <sup>22</sup> The Act does not require that children and young people be admitted to age-appropriate mental health facilities. As a result, children and young people are routinely placed in adult facilities.

In 2016, 17.8 per cent of all admissions of children and young people to in-patient mental health services were to adult in-patient units. <sup>23</sup> Further, there are only 66 operational CAMHS beds across the country, <sup>24</sup> falling significantly short of the 108 beds recommended in *A Vision for Change*. <sup>25</sup>

The Mental Health Commission's Code of Practice states that the placement of children in adult wards should be phased out by the end of 2011<sup>26</sup> but it is clear that this has not been delivered. The continued admission of children to adult units has been criticised repeatedly as being unsatisfactory by the Mental Health Commission.<sup>27</sup> Given the continued placement of children in adult in-patient wards, it is clear that the non-legally binding Code has not been effective.<sup>28</sup>

A review of the Mental Health Act 2001 was recently completed and the *Report by the Department of Health's Expert Group on the review of the Mental Health Act 2001* was published in 2015.<sup>29</sup> It contains a number of important recommendations relating specifically to children including that 'services should be provided in an age-appropriate environment wherever possible'.<sup>30</sup> It was also recommended that a new section on children should be introduced with its own set of guiding principles, including the best interests of the child and the children's right to be heard central to the section.<sup>31</sup> The report also recommended that consultation with the child is required at each and every state of diagnosis and

<sup>18</sup> UN Committee on the Rights of the Child (2003) General Comment No. 4: Adolescent Health, CRC/GC/2003/4, para 29.

<sup>19</sup> UNCRC, 'Concluding Observations: Ireland' (20016) UN Doc CRC/C/IRL/CO/3-4, para 53.

<sup>20</sup> ibid.

<sup>21</sup> Mental Health Commission, Response to the Law Reform Consultation Paper on Children and the Law: Medical Treatment (2010) 24.

<sup>22</sup> Department of Health and Children, Report of the Steering Group on the Review of the Mental Health Act 2001, (DOH 2012) 14.

<sup>23</sup> Minister of State for Mental Health and Older People, Helen McEntee TD, Written answers, Mental Health Services Data, Wednesday 29 March 2017 [415578/17].

<sup>24</sup> Ibid

<sup>25</sup> Department of Health , A Vision for Change, (2006 Stationery Office) 88 (revised as per Census 2011).

<sup>26</sup> Mental Health Commission, Code of Practice Relating to Admission of Children under the Mental Health Act 2001: Addendum (MHC 2009).

<sup>27</sup> Mental Health Commission, *Annual Report 2015* (MHC 2016) 8.

Health Service Executive, Health Service Management Data Report, September 2013, (2013 HSE), 76.

<sup>29</sup> Department of Health, Expert Group Review of the Mental Health Act, 2001 (2015 HSE) Recommendation 111.

<sup>30</sup> ibid Recommendation 113 b.

<sup>31</sup> ibid Recommendation 111.

treatment,<sup>32</sup> which is reflective of the child's right to be heard under Article 12 of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child. It is now urgent that the Mental Health Act 2001 be amended in line with the recommendations of the Expert Group Report, in particular those relating to children and young people.

### Recommendations

- Ensure that all children under 18 years receive age-appropriate mental health treatment by amending the Mental Health Act 2001 to prohibit the placement of a child under 18 years in an adult in-patient unit, save in exceptional circumstances where it would be in his or her best interests to do so.
- Invest in the provision of child and adolescent in-patient beds to ensure demand can be met.
- Put in place a legal framework to protect and fulfil the child's rights in relation to mental health by implementing the recommendations relating to children contained in the *Report of the Expert Group Review of the Mental Health Act 2001*.

### **Out of Hours Services**

Currently a young person who needs to access out-of-hours mental health treatment can generally only do so through hospital emergency departments. There are reports of young people who have attempted suicide after unacceptable waits in busy emergency departments before being assessed. This practice has been criticised by the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child which recommended that the State take action to address these issues by improving the capacity and quality of its mental health-care services for in-patient treatment, out of hours facilities and facilities for treating eating disorders'. The same provided that the State take action to address these issues by improving the capacity and quality of its mental health-care services for in-patient treatment, out of hours facilities and facilities for treating eating disorders'.

### Recommendation

 The State must prioritise the UN Committee's recommendations to strengthen capacity for outof-hours facilities.<sup>36</sup>

### **Advocacy Service for Children and Young People**

An independent advocacy and information service exists for adults with mental health difficulties,<sup>37</sup> but there is no equivalent national, independent service for those under 18 years, particularly those using in-patient services. This means that a child cannot access their rights to information,<sup>38</sup> to be heard in decision-making,<sup>39</sup> and to participate fully as service users in mental health service provision.<sup>40</sup>

The UN Committee on the Rights of the Child has recommended establishing a mental health advocacy service for children that is 'accessible and child-friendly.'  $^{41}$ 

### Recommendation

• Establish a national specialist independent, advocacy service for all children under 18 years who are engaging with mental health services.

<sup>32</sup> ibid recommendation 113.

A Lust for Life, 'We're Calling on the Government to Make Community Mental Health Care Available 24/7'
<a href="http://www.alustforlife.com/the-bigger-picture/were-calling-on-the-government-to-make-community-mental-health-care-available-247">http://www.alustforlife.com/the-bigger-picture/were-calling-on-the-government-to-make-community-mental-health-care-available-247</a>> accessed 30 January 2017.

<sup>34</sup> UNCRC, 'Concluding Observations: Ireland' (2016) UN Doc CRC/C/IRL/CO/3-4, para 53 (b).

<sup>35</sup> ibid para 54 (b).

<sup>36</sup> ibid para 53-54.

<sup>37</sup> Irish Advocacy Network <a href="http://irishadvocacynetwork.com/wp/">http://irishadvocacynetwork.com/wp/</a> [accessed 2 May 2017].

<sup>38</sup> Article 17 UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, A/RES/44/25 (20 November 1989).

<sup>39</sup> ibid Article 12.

<sup>40</sup> UN Committee on the Rights of the Child (2009) General Comment No. 12: The right of the child to be heard, CRC/C/GC/12, para. 36.

<sup>41</sup> UNCRC, 'Concluding Observations: Ireland' (20016) UN Doc CRC/C/IRL/CO/3-4, para 54 (c).

<sup>6</sup> Children's Rights Alliance (2017) Submission to the Seanad Public Consultation Committee on Children's Mental Health in Ireland